COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomizec MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

### COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

#### Giri Narasimhan

ECS 254A / EC 2474; Phone x3748; Email: giri@cs.fiu.edu HOMEPAGE: http://www.cs.fiu.edu/~giri https://moodle.cis.fiu.edu/v2.1/course/view.php?id=612

Feb 18, 2014

## Presentation Outline

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

#### Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### 1 Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

#### 4 Adversaries

▲□▶ ▲圖▶ ▲≣▶ ▲≣▶ 三国 - のへで

COT 6936:
Topics in
Algorithma
Aigorithms
Giri
Randomized
Online
Algorithms
Cache
MARKER

◆□ ▶ < 圖 ▶ < 圖 ▶ < 圖 ▶ < 圖 • 의 Q @</p>

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

It is an online algorithm with randomization

▲□▶ ▲圖▶ ▲臣▶ ▲臣▶ ―臣 … のへで

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- It is an online algorithm with randomization
- Example: If you are going on a ski trip, toss a coin and decide whether to rent/buy skis.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- It is an online algorithm with randomization
- Example: If you are going on a ski trip, toss a coin and decide whether to rent/buy skis.

▲ロト ▲帰ト ▲ヨト ▲ヨト 三日 - の々ぐ

Example: When a new item is brought into cache, randomly pick an existing item to evict.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- It is an online algorithm with randomization
- Example: If you are going on a ski trip, toss a coin and decide whether to rent/buy skis.
- Example: When a new item is brought into cache, randomly pick an existing item to evict.
- Lower bounds for deterministic online algorithms do not apply.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- It is an online algorithm with randomization
- Example: If you are going on a ski trip, toss a coin and decide whether to rent/buy skis.
- Example: When a new item is brought into cache, randomly pick an existing item to evict.
- Lower bounds for deterministic online algorithms do not apply.

Lower bound of k = size of cache does not apply for randomized cache replacement strategies.

### How to Analyze Online Algorithms?

▲ロト ▲冊 ▶ ▲ ヨ ▶ ▲ ヨ ▶ ● の Q @

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### Competitive analysis

### How to Analyze Online Algorithms?

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### Competitive analysis

Compare with optimal offline algorithm (OPT)

## How to Analyze Online Algorithms?

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### Competitive analysis

- Compare with optimal offline algorithm (OPT)
- Online Algorithm A is α-competitive if there exists constant b such that for every sequence of inputs σ:

 $COST_A(\sigma) \le \alpha \cdot COST_{OPT}(\sigma) + b$ 

### How to Analyze Randomized Online Algorithms?

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

Online Algorithm A is α-competitive if there exists constant b such that for every sequence of inputs σ:

 $COST_A(\sigma) \le \alpha \cdot COST_{OPT}(\sigma) + b$ 

### How to Analyze Randomized Online Algorithms?

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

 Online Algorithm A is α-competitive if there exists constant b such that for every sequence of inputs σ:

 $COST_A(\sigma) \le \alpha \cdot COST_{OPT}(\sigma) + b$ 

Randomized Online Algorithm A is α-competitive if there exists constant b such that for every sequence of inputs σ:

 $\boldsymbol{\mathsf{E}}[\operatorname{COST}_{\mathsf{A}}(\sigma)] \leq \alpha \operatorname{COST}_{\operatorname{OPT}}(\sigma) + \boldsymbol{\mathsf{b}}$ 

## How to Analyze Randomized Online Algorithms?

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

 Online Algorithm A is α-competitive if there exists constant b such that for every sequence of inputs σ:

 $COST_A(\sigma) \le \alpha \cdot COST_{OPT}(\sigma) + b$ 

Randomized Online Algorithm A is α-competitive if there exists constant b such that for every sequence of inputs σ:

 $\boldsymbol{\mathsf{E}}[\operatorname{COST}_{A}(\sigma)] \leq \alpha \operatorname{COST}_{\operatorname{OPT}}(\sigma) + b$ 

Use Expected cost instead

## Presentation Outline

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### Randomized Online Algorithms

2 Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ●□

#### 4 Adversaries

# **RANDOM Algorithm**

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomizec Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

 On a miss: evict an item chosen uniformly at random from all k items in cache.

▲ロト ▲周ト ▲ヨト ▲ヨト ヨー のくで

# **RANDOM Algorithm**

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

 On a miss: evict an item chosen uniformly at random from all k items in cache.

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ □ のQ@

RANDOM is k-competitive

# **RANDOM Algorithm**

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- On a miss: evict an item chosen uniformly at random from all k items in cache.
- RANDOM is k-competitive
- Can we do better than the deterministic lower bound of k for the competitiveness?

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### MARKER Algorithm

Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit

▲ロト ▲冊 ▶ ▲ ヨ ▶ ▲ ヨ ▶ ● の Q @

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### MARKER Algorithm

Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit

▲ロト ▲帰ト ▲ヨト ▲ヨト 三日 - の々ぐ

Algorithm proceeds in rounds

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### MARKER Algorithm

Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit

- Algorithm proceeds in rounds
- Start of round:

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### MARKER Algorithm

Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <

- Algorithm proceeds in rounds
- Start of round: UNMARK all pages

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### MARKER Algorithm

Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <

- Algorithm proceeds in rounds
- Start of round: UNMARK all pages
- In each round:

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### MARKER Algorithm

Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit

- Algorithm proceeds in rounds
- Start of round: UNMARK all pages
- In each round:
  - If request is a hit:

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### MARKER Algorithm

- Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit
- Algorithm proceeds in rounds
- Start of round: UNMARK all pages
- In each round:
  - If request is a hit: MARK the page

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### MARKER Algorithm

- Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit
- Algorithm proceeds in rounds
- Start of round: UNMARK all pages
- In each round:
  - If request is a hit: MARK the page

▲ロト ▲帰ト ▲ヨト ▲ヨト 三日 - の々ぐ

If request is a miss:

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### MARKER Algorithm

- Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit
- Algorithm proceeds in rounds
- Start of round: UNMARK all pages
- In each round:
  - If request is a hit: MARK the page
  - If request is a miss:
    - 1 Replace (arbitrary) UNMARKed page and MARK it

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### MARKER Algorithm

- Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit
- Algorithm proceeds in rounds
- Start of round: UNMARK all pages
- In each round:
  - If request is a hit: MARK the page
  - If request is a miss:
    - 1 Replace (arbitrary) UNMARKed page and MARK it
    - 2 If all pages are MARKed, start next round and UNMARK all pages

▲ロト ▲帰ト ▲ヨト ▲ヨト 三日 - の々ぐ

• No explicit randomization in this algorithm.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### MARKER Algorithm

- Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit
- Algorithm proceeds in rounds
- Start of round: UNMARK all pages
- In each round:
  - If request is a hit: MARK the page
  - If request is a miss:
    - 1 Replace (arbitrary) UNMARKed page and MARK it
    - 2 If all pages are MARKed, start next round and UNMARK all pages
- No explicit randomization in this algorithm.
  - Arbitrary replacement can be implemented as say a FIFO or LIFO of unmarked items

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### MARKER Algorithm

- Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit
- Algorithm proceeds in rounds
- Start of round: UNMARK all pages
- In each round:
  - If request is a hit: MARK the page
  - If request is a miss:
    - 1 Replace (arbitrary) UNMARKed page and MARK it
    - 2 If all pages are MARKed, start next round and UNMARK all pages
- No explicit randomization in this algorithm.
  - Arbitrary replacement can be implemented as say a FIFO or LIFO of unmarked items
- LRU is in fact a MARKing algorithm.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### MARKER Algorithm

- Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit
- Algorithm proceeds in rounds
- Start of round: UNMARK all pages
- In each round:
  - If request is a hit: MARK the page
  - If request is a miss:
    - 1 Replace (arbitrary) UNMARKed page and MARK it
    - 2 If all pages are MARKed, start next round and UNMARK all pages

- No explicit randomization in this algorithm.
  - Arbitrary replacement can be implemented as say a FIFO or LIFO of unmarked items
- LRU is in fact a MARKing algorithm. Why?

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### Randomized MARKER Algorithm

▲□▶ ▲圖▶ ▲厘▶ ▲厘▶ 厘 の��

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

### Randomized MARKER Algorithm

- Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit
- Algorithm proceeds in rounds
- Start of round: UNMARK all pages
- In each round:
  - If request is a hit: MARK the page
  - If request is a miss:
    - 1 Replace (arbitrary) UNMARKed page chosen uniformly at random and MARK it

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

### Randomized MARKER Algorithm

- Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit
- Algorithm proceeds in rounds
- Start of round: UNMARK all pages
- In each round:
  - If request is a hit: MARK the page
  - If request is a miss:
    - Replace (arbitrary) UNMARKed page chosen uniformly at random and MARK it
    - 2 If all pages are MARKed, start next round and UNMARK all pages

▲ロト ▲帰 ト ▲ ヨ ト ▲ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ・ の Q ()

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

### Randomized MARKER Algorithm

- Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit
- Algorithm proceeds in rounds
- Start of round: UNMARK all pages
- In each round:
  - If request is a hit: MARK the page
  - If request is a miss:
    - Replace (arbitrary) UNMARKed page chosen uniformly at random and MARK it
    - 2 If all pages are MARKed, start next round and UNMARK all pages

▲ロト ▲帰 ト ▲ ヨ ト ▲ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ・ の Q ()

• Has explicit randomization in this algorithm.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

### Randomized MARKER Algorithm

- Each of k pages in cache has a MARKer bit
- Algorithm proceeds in rounds
- Start of round: UNMARK all pages
- In each round:
  - If request is a hit: MARK the page
  - If request is a miss:
    - Replace (arbitrary) UNMARKed page chosen uniformly at random and MARK it
    - 2 If all pages are MARKed, start next round and UNMARK all pages

▲ロト ▲帰 ト ▲ ヨ ト ▲ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ・ の Q ()

- Has explicit randomization in this algorithm.
- Analysis: This algorithm is  $2H_k$ -competitive.
#### Presentation Outline

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### Randomized Online Algorithms

2 Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

#### 3 Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

#### 4 Adversaries

◆□> <圖> < E> < E> E のQQ

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

Divide the request sequence into phases  $\sigma(i), \ldots, \sigma(j)$ ,

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

Divide the request sequence into phases  $\sigma(i), \ldots, \sigma(j)$ , where j is the smallest integer such that

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

Divide the request sequence into phases  $\sigma(i), \ldots, \sigma(j)$ , where j is the smallest integer such that

 $\{\sigma(i),\ldots,\sigma(j+1)\}$ 

contains k + 1 distinct pages. At the end of a phase, all pages are MARKed.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

Divide the request sequence into phases  $\sigma(i), \ldots, \sigma(j)$ , where j is the smallest integer such that

 $\{\sigma(i),\ldots,\sigma(j+1)\}$ 

contains k + 1 distinct pages. At the end of a phase, all pages are MARKed. A page is stale if it is unMARKed but was MAKRKed in previous phase. A page is clean if it is neither stale nor MARKed. Let c = # of clean pages requested in phase. Claim 1: Amortized # of faults by OPT in phase is  $\ge c/2$ Claim 2: Expected number of faults by MARKER is  $\le cH_k$ .

◆□ > ◆□ > ◆□ > ◆□ > ◆□ > ◆□ >

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### **OPT**: Let the # of pages in $S_{OPT} \setminus S_M$ be $d_I$ at start of phase

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

OPT: Let the # of pages in  $S_{OPT} \setminus S_M$  be  $d_I$  at start of phase and  $d_F$  at end of phase.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

OPT: Let the # of pages in  $S_{OPT} \setminus S_M$  be  $d_I$  at start of phase and  $d_F$  at end of phase. OPT has at least  $c - d_I$  faults.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

OPT: Let the # of pages in  $S_{OPT} \setminus S_M$  be  $d_I$  at start of phase and  $d_F$  at end of phase. OPT has at least  $c - d_I$  faults. Also OPT has at least  $d_F$  faults.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

OPT: Let the # of pages in  $S_{OPT} \setminus S_M$  be  $d_I$  at start of phase and  $d_F$  at end of phase. OPT has at least  $c - d_I$  faults. Also OPT has at least  $d_F$  faults. Why?

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomizec Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

OPT: Let the # of pages in  $S_{OPT} \setminus S_M$  be  $d_I$  at start of phase and  $d_F$  at end of phase. OPT has at least  $c - d_I$  faults. Also OPT has at least  $d_F$  faults. Why? A clean page is a miss for MARKER. Thus c clean pages are not in  $S_M$ . At best, they are from  $S_{OPT} \setminus S_M$ . But  $|S_{OPT} \setminus S_M| = d_I$ . Hence OPT has  $\geq c - d_I$  misses.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomizec Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

OPT: Let the # of pages in  $S_{OPT} \setminus S_M$  be  $d_I$  at start of phase and  $d_F$  at end of phase. OPT has at least  $c - d_I$  faults. Also OPT has at least  $d_F$  faults. Why? A clean page is a miss for MARKER. Thus c clean pages are not in  $S_M$ . At best, they are from  $S_{OPT} \setminus S_M$ . But  $|S_{OPT} \setminus S_M| = d_I$ . Hence OPT has  $\geq c - d_I$  misses. The  $d_F$  pages from  $S_M \setminus S_{OPT}$  were accessed, but not present at end of phase in  $S_{OPT}$ . Hence they were evicted by OPT on some miss. Thus OPT had at least  $d_F$  misses.

$$\max\{c - d_I, d_F\} \ge (c - d_I + d_F)/2 = c/2 - d_I/2 + d_F/2$$

Amortized over all requests, the second and last terms start to cancel off, giving us  $\geq c/2$  faults.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomizec Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

OPT: Let the # of pages in  $S_{OPT} \setminus S_M$  be  $d_I$  at start of phase and  $d_F$  at end of phase. OPT has at least  $c - d_I$  faults. Also OPT has at least  $d_F$  faults. Why? A clean page is a miss for MARKER. Thus c clean pages are not in  $S_M$ . At best, they are from  $S_{OPT} \setminus S_M$ . But  $|S_{OPT} \setminus S_M| = d_I$ . Hence OPT has  $\geq c - d_I$  misses. The  $d_F$  pages from  $S_M \setminus S_{OPT}$  were accessed, but not present at end of phase in  $S_{OPT}$ . Hence they were evicted by OPT on some miss. Thus OPT had at least  $d_F$  misses.

$$\max\{c - d_I, d_F\} \ge (c - d_I + d_F)/2 = c/2 - d_I/2 + d_F/2$$

Amortized over all requests, the second and last terms start to cancel off, giving us  $\geq c/2$  faults.

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 のへぐ

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### **OPT**: $\geq c/2$ faults.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### **OPT**: $\geq c/2$ faults.

MARKER: k - c stale pages in cache. Let c(i) (and s(i)) be the number of clean (and stale, resp.) pages requested before the *i*-th stale page.

Thus, expected cost of request is

$$\frac{s(i)-c(i)}{s(i)}\cdot 0 + \frac{c(i)}{s(i)}\cdot 1 \leq \frac{c}{s(i)} = \frac{c}{k-i+1}$$

When summed over all iterations, we have

$$\sum_{i=1}^{s} \frac{c}{k-i+1} \le \sum_{i=2}^{k} \frac{c}{i} = c(H_k - 1)$$

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

Claim 1: Amortized # of faults by OPT in phase is  $\geq c/2$ Claim 2: Expected number of faults by MARKER is  $\leq cH_k$ .

#### COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

Claim 1: Amortized # of faults by OPT in phase is  $\geq c/2$ Claim 2: Expected number of faults by MARKER is  $\leq cH_k$ . Claim 3: Randomized MARKER is  $2H_k$ -competitive. Claim 4: If R is a randomized online paging algorithm that is

*c*-competitive against any oblivious adversary, then  $c \ge H_k$ .

### Presentation Outline

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

#### Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

・ロト ・ 理 ト ・ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ト

3

#### 4 Adversaries

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

• When doing worst-case analysis of online, we assume that

▲ロト ▲周ト ▲ヨト ▲ヨト ヨー のくで

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

When doing worst-case analysis of online, we assume that there is an adversary

▲ロト ▲冊 ▶ ▲ ヨ ▶ ▲ ヨ ▶ ● の Q @

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

When doing worst-case analysis of online, we assume that there is an adversary who is generating a request sequence in order to make algorithm perform as poorly as possible.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

When doing worst-case analysis of online, we assume that there is an adversary who is generating a request sequence in order to make algorithm perform as poorly as possible. Adversary is powerful – knows your algorithm!

▲ロト ▲帰ト ▲ヨト ▲ヨト 三日 - の々ぐ

In analyzing randomized online algs, we have 3 choices:

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- When doing worst-case analysis of online, we assume that there is an adversary who is generating a request sequence in order to make algorithm perform as poorly as possible. Adversary is powerful – knows your algorithm!
- In analyzing randomized online algs, we have 3 choices:
  - Oblivious adversary: adversary generates request sequence at start. I.e.,

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- When doing worst-case analysis of online, we assume that there is an adversary who is generating a request sequence in order to make algorithm perform as poorly as possible. Adversary is powerful – knows your algorithm!
- In analyzing randomized online algs, we have 3 choices:
  - Oblivious adversary: adversary generates request sequence at start. I.e., cannot see action of algorithm or random choices.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- When doing worst-case analysis of online, we assume that there is an adversary who is generating a request sequence in order to make algorithm perform as poorly as possible. Adversary is powerful – knows your algorithm!
- In analyzing randomized online algs, we have 3 choices:
  - Oblivious adversary: adversary generates request sequence at start. I.e., cannot see action of algorithm or random choices. Adversary serves offline.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- When doing worst-case analysis of online, we assume that there is an adversary who is generating a request sequence in order to make algorithm perform as poorly as possible. Adversary is powerful – knows your algorithm!
- In analyzing randomized online algs, we have 3 choices:
  - Oblivious adversary: adversary generates request sequence at start. I.e., cannot see action of algorithm or random choices. Adversary serves offline.
  - Adaptive online adversary: adversary generates request sequence adaptively (online). I.e.,

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- When doing worst-case analysis of online, we assume that there is an adversary who is generating a request sequence in order to make algorithm perform as poorly as possible. Adversary is powerful – knows your algorithm!
- In analyzing randomized online algs, we have 3 choices:
  - Oblivious adversary: adversary generates request sequence at start. I.e., cannot see action of algorithm or random choices. Adversary serves offline.
  - Adaptive online adversary: adversary generates request sequence adaptively (online). I.e., can see action, but not random choices. Adversary serves online

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- When doing worst-case analysis of online, we assume that there is an adversary who is generating a request sequence in order to make algorithm perform as poorly as possible. Adversary is powerful – knows your algorithm!
- In analyzing randomized online algs, we have 3 choices:
  - Oblivious adversary: adversary generates request sequence at start. I.e., cannot see action of algorithm or random choices. Adversary serves offline.
  - Adaptive online adversary: adversary generates request sequence adaptively (online). I.e., can see action, but not random choices. Adversary serves online
  - Adaptive oine adversary: adversary generates request sequence adaptively, and knows the result of the coin tosses.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- When doing worst-case analysis of online, we assume that there is an adversary who is generating a request sequence in order to make algorithm perform as poorly as possible. Adversary is powerful – knows your algorithm!
- In analyzing randomized online algs, we have 3 choices:
  - Oblivious adversary: adversary generates request sequence at start. I.e., cannot see action of algorithm or random choices. Adversary serves offline.
  - Adaptive online adversary: adversary generates request sequence adaptively (online). I.e., can see action, but not random choices. Adversary serves online
  - Adaptive oine adversary: adversary generates request sequence adaptively, and knows the result of the coin tosses. Adversary serves offline

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomizec Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

■ ∃ randomized *c*-competitive algorithm against *adaptive offline adversary* ⇒

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

■ ∃ randomized *c*-competitive algorithm against *adaptive offline adversary* ⇒ ∃ deterministic *c*-competitive algorithm.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- ∃ randomized *c*-competitive algorithm against *adaptive* offline adversary ⇒ ∃ deterministic *c*-competitive algorithm.
- ∃ randomized *c*-competitive algorithm against *adaptive online adversary* and

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- ∃ randomized *c*-competitive algorithm against *adaptive offline adversary* ⇒ ∃ deterministic *c*-competitive algorithm.
- ∃ randomized c-competitive algorithm against adaptive online adversary and ∃ d-competitive algorithm against oblivious adversary ⇒

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- ∃ randomized *c*-competitive algorithm against *adaptive* offline adversary ⇒ ∃ deterministic *c*-competitive algorithm.
- ∃ randomized *c*-competitive algorithm against *adaptive* online adversary and ∃ *d*-competitive algorithm against oblivious adversary ⇒ ∃ *c* · *d*-competitive algorithm against any adaptive offline adversary.

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- ∃ randomized *c*-competitive algorithm against *adaptive* offline adversary ⇒ ∃ deterministic *c*-competitive algorithm.
- ∃ randomized c-competitive algorithm against adaptive online adversary and ∃ d-competitive algorithm against oblivious adversary ⇒ ∃ c · d-competitive algorithm against any adaptive offline adversary.
- ∃ randomized c-competitive algorithm against adaptive online adversary ⇒

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- ∃ randomized *c*-competitive algorithm against *adaptive* offline adversary ⇒ ∃ deterministic *c*-competitive algorithm.
- ∃ randomized c-competitive algorithm against adaptive online adversary and ∃ d-competitive algorithm against oblivious adversary ⇒ ∃ c · d-competitive algorithm against any adaptive offline adversary.
- ∃ randomized c-competitive algorithm against adaptive online adversary ⇒ ∃ deterministic c<sup>2</sup>-competitive algorithm.

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <
## Relationship between Adversary Models

COT 6936: Topics in Algorithms

Giri Narasimhan

Randomized Online Algorithms

Randomized Cache Replacement Strategies

Analyzing Randomized MARKER Algorithm

Adversaries

- ∃ randomized *c*-competitive algorithm against *adaptive* offline adversary ⇒ ∃ deterministic *c*-competitive algorithm.
- ∃ randomized c-competitive algorithm against adaptive online adversary and ∃ d-competitive algorithm against oblivious adversary ⇒ ∃ c · d-competitive algorithm against any adaptive offline adversary.
- ∃ randomized *c*-competitive algorithm against *adaptive* online adversary ⇒ ∃ deterministic c<sup>2</sup>-competitive algorithm.

[Ben-David, Borodin, Karp, Tardos, Wigderson, Algorithmica, 1994]

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <